

EVALUATING WOMEN AND YOUTH TRANSFORMING LOCAL PUBLIC SERVICES IN HEBRON PROJECT

FINAL EVALUATION

30 June 2024

ABC Consulting

Table of Contents

Abbreviations and acronyms	3
Executive Summary.....	4
1. Introduction and development context.....	6
1.1 Project Basic Information	6
1.2 About this Assignment.....	6
1.3 About this report.....	7
2. Project Description and Scope:.....	8
2.1 Project Goals and objectives & components	8
2.2 Purpose of the Evaluation:	8
2.3 Evaluation methodology	10
2.4 Development Context.....	11
3. Project Strategy	13
3.1 Summary of the Project Framework	13
3.2 Analysis of Project Theory of Change (ToC)	14
4. Evaluation Findings.....	16
4.1 Relevance	16
4.2 Effectiveness.....	19
4.3 Efficiency.....	23
4.4 Impact	26
4.5 Sustainability.....	29
5. Recommendations.....	32
6. Annexes.....	34
6.1 Annex 1 – Tool for Interviews with Project staff.....	34
6.2 Annex 2 – Tool for Interviews with Municipal Staff	36
6.3 Annex 3 – Tool for Interviews with CSOs & CBOs	37
6.4 Annex 4 – Tool for Focus Group Discussion with Women & Youth.....	38
6.5 Annex 5 – Project Beneficiary Survey	39
6.6 Annex 6 – Tool for CSOs assessment on women’s rights and women political participation.....	41

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

Abbreviations and acronyms

ApS	Alianza por la Solidaridad (Alianza), Member of ActionAid
DAC	Development Assistance Committee criteria.
CBOs	Community Based Organizations
CSOs	Civil Society Organizations
GOIB	Balearic Government
ICT	Information and Communication Technologies
PNA	Palestinian National Authority
PITA	The Palestinian Information Technology Association of Companies (PITA):

Executive Summary

Project Overview

The "Women and Youth Transforming Local Public Services in Hebron" project, implemented by the Palestinian Information Technology Association of Companies (PITA) and Alianza por la Solidaridad (a member of ActionAid), aimed to empower vulnerable groups, particularly women and youth, to actively participate in local development processes. The project, funded by the European Commission and the Balearic Government, spanned from April 1, 2021, to March 31, 2024, and focused on enhancing the capacities of Community-Based Organizations (CBOs) and Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) in Hebron to improve public service delivery.

Methodology

The evaluation, conducted by ABC Consulting, employed a participatory methodology adhering to the Development Assistance Committee (DAC) criteria. The process included a comprehensive desk review, interviews with 14 stakeholders, a focus group with beneficiary organizations, and a survey yielding 16 responses. The evaluation aimed to assess the project's relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, and sustainability.

Key Results

a. Relevance

The project was highly relevant to the needs and priorities of women and youth in Hebron, aligning with local, national, and international development strategies. The focus on improving the inclusiveness and responsiveness of municipal services was well-justified. However, unforeseen obstacles and a volatile security situation impacted the relevance and impact of some project outputs.

b. Effectiveness

The project demonstrated mixed effectiveness. While it made progress in building the capacity of CBOs and promoting innovative ICT tools, the challenging security situation and COVID-19 pandemic hindered the implementation of some activities. Stakeholder satisfaction was mixed, with some areas showing positive impacts and others indicating limited success.

c. Efficiency

The project's efficiency was mixed. While some cost-effective solutions were achieved through strategic partnerships and capacity building, coordination gaps, risk management limitations, and contextual disruptions undermined efficiency. The monitoring and evaluation system did not provide a strong basis for efficiency tracking and informed decision-making.

d. Impact

The project achieved some positive impacts, such as enhancing individual capacities and raising awareness among Hebron Municipality. However, the full extent and sustainability of its impact are uncertain due to significant challenges encountered during implementation. Translating initial empowerment into sustained participation in decision-making processes remains an ongoing challenge.

e. Sustainability

The project showed promising signs of sustainability, particularly in influencing individual capacities and attitudes of the Hebron Municipality. However, ensuring long-term sustainability will require continued efforts to translate initial outcomes into lasting institutional, financial, and social changes. Strengthening partnerships, securing long-term funding, and addressing socio-cultural barriers are crucial.

Summary Conclusion and Recommendations

The project demonstrated the relevance of inclusive municipal governance as a driver of local development in Hebron. Despite some shortcomings, it achieved notable successes in a challenging environment. To enhance future efforts, the following recommendations are proposed:

1. **Capacity Building for Inclusive Advocacy:** Develop comprehensive programs for CBOs and CSOs to enhance advocacy skills.
2. **Institutionalizing Participatory Governance:** Establish formal mechanisms for regular dialogue between the municipality and CSOs.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

3. **Enhancing Transparency and Access to Information:** Support the development of user-friendly information-sharing platforms.
4. **Continue promoting Inclusive and Responsive Public Services:** Conduct comprehensive needs assessments and adopt participatory service delivery approaches.
5. **Continue strengthening Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment:** Advocate for gender-responsive budgeting and support gender-sensitive advocacy campaigns.
6. **Continue enhancing Community Engagement and Ownership:** Implement community outreach strategies and participatory monitoring mechanisms.
7. **Ensuring Sustainability and Scalability:** Develop a comprehensive sustainability strategy and explore opportunities for scaling successful interventions.
8. **Strengthening Monitoring, Evaluation, and Learning:** Develop a robust monitoring and evaluation framework with clear indicators.
9. **Continue fostering Multi-Stakeholder Partnerships:** Cultivate strong partnerships with government agencies, donors, and civil society networks.

1. Introduction and development context

1.1 PROJECT BASIC INFORMATION

Project Title: "Women and Youth Transforming Local Public Services in Hebron"

Project Partners:

- A. The Palestinian Information Technology Association of Companies (PITA): A non-profit organization founded in 1999 to advance the interests and positive societal impact of Palestine's Information and Communication Technology (ICT) sector. PITA represents more than 180 major ICT companies in Palestine's emerging technology and start-up ecosystem.
- B. Alianza por la Solidaridad (Alianza), member of ActionAid (ApS): An international organization working in Palestine since 1993, focusing on prevention and response to Gender-Based Violence, women's economic empowerment, and women's participation and active citizenship. Alianza has been a member of ActionAid since June 2018.

Funding Agencies: The project is jointly funded by the European Commission and the Balearic Government (GOIB).

- A. Project Timeframe: The project spans three years, commencing on April 1, 2021, and concluding on March 31, 2024.
- B. Geographical Coverage: The project activities are centered in Hebron city, Palestine.

Project Goals:

- A. Overarching Goal: The project seeks to empower vulnerable groups, particularly women and youth, to become agents of change in local development processes, thereby fostering a more equitable, inclusive, and democratic society in Palestine.
- B. Specific Goal: The project aims to enhance the capacities of Community-Based Organizations (CBOs) and Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) in Hebron, enabling them to effectively address and respond to the needs and interests of women and youth in the context of public service delivery.

1.2 ABOUT THIS ASSIGNMENT

The assignment involves conducting a final evaluation of the "Women and Youth Transforming Local Public Services in Hebron" project, jointly implemented by the Palestinian Information Technology Association of Companies (PITA) and Alianza por la Solidaridad (a member of ActionAid). The project, spanning from April 1, 2021, to March 31, 2024, in Hebron, West Bank, Palestine, aims to empower vulnerable groups, particularly women and youth, to actively participate in local development processes, thereby fostering a more equitable, open, and democratic society. The project's key objectives include:

1. Enhancing the capacities of Community-Based Organizations (CBOs) and Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) in Hebron to better serve and represent women and youth.
2. Strengthening engagement between local public institutions and CSOs.
3. Encouraging active CSO participation in governance processes and improving public access to official information.

The project comprises various activities designed to build the capacities of CBOs and CSOs, such as training sessions, workshops, and advocacy campaigns. These initiatives aim to improve the delivery of public services that are responsive to the needs of women and youth and to promote a participatory approach in local governance.

1. INTRODUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT CONTEXT

The purpose of the final external evaluation is to assess the project's effectiveness, efficiency, relevance, sustainability, and impact, including:

1. Evaluating the achievement of the project's objectives and outcomes against its logical framework.
2. Assessing the project design and its responsiveness to the challenges faced by women and youth in accessing public services.
3. Analyzing resource allocation, the sustainability of project outcomes, and the long-term continuation of benefits.

1.3 ABOUT THIS REPORT

This final evaluation report presents a comprehensive analysis of the project's key findings and offers strategic and actionable recommendations. It serves to align the understanding of the contracting Authority (PITA) and the consultant (ABC Consulting) regarding the assignment's outcomes.

The report is structured as follows:

- Introduction: Provides an overview of the project and its objectives.
- Project description, objectives, and scope
- The context
- Approach and Methodology
- Findings
- Recommendations
- Annexes

2. PROJECT DESCRIPTION AND SCOPE:

2. Project Description and Scope:

2.1 PROJECT GOALS AND OBJECTIVES & COMPONENTS

Overall Objective:

The project seeks to empower vulnerable groups, particularly women and youth, to become agents of change in local development processes, thereby fostering a more equitable, inclusive, and democratic society in Palestine.

Specific Objectives:

The project seeks to enable Community-Based Organizations (CBOs) and Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) to meaningfully contribute to making public services in Hebron more accessible and responsive to the needs and interests of women and youth

Key Project Components

1. Empowering Women and Youth-led CBOs: The project will focus on building the capacity of CBOs led by women and youth, equipping them with the skills and resources to advocate for public services that are gender-sensitive, youth-friendly, and accountable to the community.
2. Enhancing Service Delivery Mechanisms: The project will collaborate with the Hebron municipality to establish participatory, innovative, and accessible service delivery mechanisms that are responsive to the needs of citizens, particularly women and youth.
3. Strengthening Municipal Capacities: The project will work towards enhancing the capacities of the Hebron municipality to effectively manage and promote citizen participation, as well as to respond to feedback from the community.
4. Fostering Community Engagement: The project will strive to increase community support and involvement in the activities of CBOs and CSOs, facilitating their advocacy efforts and policy dialogue with the Hebron Municipality.

2.2 PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION:

The evaluation aims to provide a comprehensive assessment of the project's relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, and sustainability, while also examining its impact on strengthening the role of vulnerable groups as agents of change in local development processes. This will contribute to a more equal, open, and democratic society in Palestine. Specifically, the evaluation will focus on the following criteria:

1. Relevance - the extent to which the project addressed the needs and priorities of women and youth in Hebron and contributed to local development processes.
 - How well did the project objectives align with the needs and priorities of women and youth in Hebron?
 - To what extent did the project design adequately address the specific challenges faced by women and youth in accessing public services?
 - How relevant were the project activities in contributing to local development processes in Hebron?
 - Did the project's target groups and stakeholders perceive the project as relevant to their needs?
2. Effectiveness - the degree to which the project achieved its intended outcomes and objectives in enhancing the capacity of CBOs and CSOs to address women and youth needs.
 - To what degree did the project achieve its intended outcomes and objectives?
 - How effectively did the project enhance the capacity of CBOs and CSOs to address the needs of women and youth in public service delivery?

2. PROJECT DESCRIPTION AND SCOPE:

- What were the major factors that contributed to or hindered the achievement of project outcomes?
 - How satisfied were the project's target groups with the quality and accessibility of public services after the project's intervention?
 - To what extent did the project foster collaboration and partnerships between CBOs/CSOs and local public institutions?
3. Efficiency - how well project resources were utilized to achieve the intended outcomes, including risk mitigation and adaptations made.
- Were project resources (funds, expertise, time) utilized efficiently to achieve the intended outcomes?
 - Did the project activities and outputs justify the resources invested?
 - How well did the project manage and mitigate risks, adapt to changes, and address any delays or force majeure events during implementation?
 - Could the project have achieved similar results with fewer resources or in a shorter timeframe?
 - How efficient were the project's monitoring and evaluation processes in tracking progress, informing decision-making, and ensuring accountability?
4. Impact - the sustainable changes achieved in improving access to quality public services for women and youth and empowering their participation in decision-making.
- What sustainable changes did the project bring about in improving access to quality public services for women and youth in Hebron?
 - To what extent did the project empower women and youth to actively participate in decision-making processes related to public service provision?
 - What unintended positive or negative impacts did the project have on the target groups and the wider community?
 - How has the project influenced policies, practices, or attitudes towards women and youth participation in local development processes?
5. Sustainability - the likelihood that project benefits will continue in the medium to long-term and commitment of parties to continue, replicate or institutionalize the processes and knowledge from the project.
- What is the likelihood that the project's benefits will continue beyond its completion?
 - To what extent are the CBOs, CSOs, and local authorities committed to continuing, expanding, or replicating the processes and knowledge acquired through the project?
 - What efforts were made by project partners to enhance sustainability within the project circumstances?
 - Are there any institutional, financial, or social factors that may support or hinder the long-term sustainability of project outcomes?

2. PROJECT DESCRIPTION AND SCOPE:

2.3 EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

The evaluation process, spanning from May 1 to June 6, 2024, was meticulously crafted to delve into the intricate facets of the project's operations, adhering to the internationally recognized Development Assistance Committee (DAC) criteria. This all-encompassing approach aimed to scrutinize various critical aspects, delivering an in-depth assessment of the project's relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, and sustainability while also investigating its influence on empowering vulnerable groups as catalysts for change in local development initiatives.

ABC Consulting, a team comprising a team leader, an evaluation expert, and four junior researchers, spearheaded the execution of the evaluation. In line with the agreed-upon process delineated in the inception report, the evaluators were furnished with a collection of project documents. Throughout their data gathering, the evaluation team undertook a comprehensive desk review and conducted interviews with a diverse range of stakeholders (14 individuals), including project management, coordinators, the Hebron Municipality, and youth organizations. Additionally, a focus group was held with beneficiary organizations, and a survey was disseminated to organizations, yielding 16 responses.

To tackle this momentous undertaking, the evaluation team employed a participatory methodology, which facilitated an all-inclusive and comprehensive approach. This methodology was meticulously tailored to integrate diverse perspectives and voices while stringently upholding ethical standards throughout the evaluation process. A crucial component of this approach was an exhaustive examination of an extensive array of documentation on women's and youth participation, encompassing project reports, foundational materials, and contemporaneous contextual documents.

The evaluation methodology also incorporated open dialogues and discussions, facilitated through a series of interviews conducted at the beginning and end of the evaluation period. These exchanges provided profound insights into the project's operations and its ramifications on various stakeholders. The evaluation team engaged not only with the project's management and staff but also with beneficiary organizations and the Hebron Municipality, who contributed their unique perspectives. This collaborative endeavor yielded a comprehensive understanding of the project's outcomes and achievements.

By embracing a holistic, multifaceted, and ethically grounded approach, ABC Consulting aims to deliver an evaluation that is not only thorough but also encapsulates the project's significant and promising future impact.

2. PROJECT DESCRIPTION AND SCOPE:

2.4 DEVELOPMENT CONTEXT

Palestinian women are multifaceted individuals whose status is influenced by a variety of internal and external circumstances. Women have always made a significant contribution to the national movement and the creation of an independent Palestinian state. They also take part in ensuring justice and equality in rights and obligations, as well as in the process of development. In this context, women have made great strides in involvement in society and politics, as well as in the domains of education and health. In a number of open national councils and committees, such as the Executive Committee of the Palestine Liberation Organization and the Palestinian National Council, women have also succeeded in achieving increased levels of involvement. Furthermore, a large number of women work in high roles in Palestinian National Authority (PNA) institutions, including those of judges, ambassadors, governors, and ministers.¹

Palestinian women's involvement in local government is one area that has made significant strides; in fact, the National Development Plan (2014–2016) placed a strong emphasis on the need to support women's engagement in local government and local government strengthening. Furthermore, the Cross-Sectoral National Gender Strategy: Promoting Gender Equality and Equity (2011–2016) was implemented with the objective of enhancing women's involvement in decision-making roles at the local and national levels. Aside from emphasizing the need to empower local bodies to hold active institutional powers and encourage them to work with the public and private sectors as well as civil society organizations (CSOs) to achieve sustainable development, the Strategic Framework for The Ministry of Local Government (2010–2014) also emphasized the importance of taking gender equality into account when preparing and implementing the ministry's general strategic plan. The objectives are increased democracy, openness, and involvement in local government for women.² The gender unit at the Ministry of Local Government also developed a statement with the goal of closing the gender gap in all local government domains, enhancing women's engagement, integrating gender concerns into ministry plans and programs, and increasing the number of women serving on local councils. Despite the ministry's efforts, progress was sluggish and frequently left unfinished. The government frequently appointed new members with political clout or members of powerful families to replace both elected and appointed local councils.³

Despite such advancements, the rights and involvement of Palestinian women and girls are still significantly impacted by geographic dispersion, internal political disputes, numerous legal frameworks, and the Palestinian government's limited jurisdiction in the occupied Palestinian territory. Palestinian women are still underrepresented in bodies that make decisions at all levels of public life, and any progress they make is unstable because of ongoing political unrest. The data of the Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics for the years 2018–2019 exhibited a clear gap in the percentage of women holding decision-making positions as follows; the percentage of women in the Palestinian Central Council was (5.4%), in the Palestinian Legislative Council (11.3%), in the Palestinian National Council (10.6%), in the Executive Committee of the Palestine Liberation Organization (6.7%), in the Palestinian Cabinet (13.6%) and in the diplomatic sector (11.2%).⁴

¹ <https://www.awrad.org/files/server/2-20170115163818.pdf>

² Ministry of Local Government, Strategic Framework for Ministry of Local Government, 2010–2014
http://www.molg.pna.ps/studies/strategic_plan.pdf

³ <https://repository.najah.edu/server/api/core/bitstreams/8eb77f29-9187-4dc8-b6f0-9426c25c2968/content>

⁴ <https://palestine.unwomen.org/en/what-we-do/leadership-and-political-participation-5>

2. PROJECT DESCRIPTION AND SCOPE:

In order to improve Palestinian women's involvement in local governmental bodies, the legal framework must be activated. This will lead to the adoption of laws that will improve the opportunity for women to participate in decision-making. As constitutions and legislations are important tools for determining the legitimacy of rights, duties, and responsibilities for individuals as well as determining the future of women's reality and status in the Palestinian community, it is assured that, even in times of political unrest or instability—such as the Israeli occupation and political division—the application of national laws and their implementation procedures must always be engaged.⁵ Second, a number of issues, particularly the place of women in leadership and politics, need to be reevaluated and given top priority by the Palestinian government. The third step involves creating a scholarly and social forum to increase awareness of the issue in Palestinian culture and to educate women about their right to engage in decision making. Fourth, creating a foundation for future planning and development initiatives that will strengthen the position and contributions of women.⁶

Local government positions for women continue to be complex, with both opportunities and barriers. There is still a dearth of understanding about women's roles, representation, and influence. A survey found that, while two-thirds of individuals recognized women were represented on local councils, more than one-third were unaware or unsure. Of those who were aware, 38% knew councilwomen personally, 49% knew them briefly, and 13% knew nothing. When asked about the impact of women on local council initiatives and projects, 55% indicated they have a substantial or moderate influence, while 31% said they have no influence at all. The proportion of women who positively appraised councilwomen's contributions was 60%, compared to 51% for men. Furthermore, it is a misguided idea for women to have positions in municipal councils. Divergent views exist on the employment of women in governing bodies. 44% of respondents support recruiting women for local council jobs, 43% prefer hiring them for some roles, and 13% are adamantly against the concept. 34% of men and 54% of women, respectively, support the appointment of women to local council posts. The conventional perspective of women's roles is the primary cause of opposition to women's participation in local governments. "It's better for a woman to stay at home and care for her family," a manager at one municipality claims. It is easier for a woman who is unmarried and does not have to care for her family. Some people still believe that women have no place in municipal employment and consider it to be an unreasonable expectation. "The municipality is a difficult and complex place with many demands and late meetings that women are unable to attend," a youth council activist explains. Furthermore, there is a disparity in the seriousness with which ministry employees and leadership approach the implementation of programs and policies aimed at promoting equality. The ministry also has a centralized decision-making process and limited authority for directorates to interact with councilwomen. Finally, women's lack of clarity in their relationship with the Ministry of Local Government, confusion about the ministry's support in an emergency, and the fact that many councilwomen are uninformed of their obligations and rights all serve as hurdles to their participation in local governance.⁷

⁵ <https://pwwsd.org/page/women/en>

⁶ <https://palestine.unwomen.org/en/what-we-do/leadership-and-political-participation-5>

⁷ <https://www.awrad.org/files/server/2-20170115163818.pdf>

3. Project Strategy

3.1 SUMMARY OF THE PROJECT FRAMEWORK

The logical framework document for the **Women and Youth Transforming local public services in Hebron** logframe outlines overall objective, objectives, expected outcomes, and key outputs as follows:

C. Overall Objective (Impact):

The project aims to strengthen the role of marginalized groups as actors for change in local development processes to create a more equal, open, and democratic society in Palestine.

D. Specific Objective:

- Strengthening capacities of CBOs and CSOs in Hebron to better serve and represent women and youth.
- Increasing engagement between local public institutions and CSOs.
- Promoting active CSO participation in governance processes and enhancing public access to official information.

E. Expected Results (Outcomes):

1. Youth and women-led CBOs and CSOs advocate and engage in policy dialogue with the Hebron municipality for more gender-sensitive, youth-friendly, and accountable public services.
2. Innovative, participatory, and accessible service delivery mechanisms are in place and operative in the Hebron Municipality.
3. Strengthened capacities of the municipality in Hebron to manage/promote citizens' participation and respond to feedback.
4. Increased community support and involvement in the work of CBOs and CSOs, to promote coordination spaces for advocacy and policy dialogue with local authorities and service providers.

F. Key Outputs:

- Increased suggestions submitted to the Municipality to respond to women and youth needs
- Greater engagement of CBOs and women's associations in accountability sessions with the municipality
- Increased awareness of women's rights and political participation among CBO and CSO members
- Integration of complaint/feedback mechanisms and good governance principles in municipality-led centers
- Increased female users of e-services and innovative ICT solutions for citizen feedback
- Development and adoption of an internal policy on citizen's participation by the Municipality of Hebron
- Improved communication channels between the Municipality and its service providers/centers
- Increased capacity and commitment of municipality staff to support gender equality and women's rights
- Enhanced community support for CBOs and increased participation in their activities
- Implementation of recommendations suggested by women's organizations in local campaigns.
- Strengthened capacities of CBOs in human resources, finance, and organizational areas.

3. PROJECT STRATEGY

3.2 ANALYSIS OF PROJECT THEORY OF CHANGE (TOC)

The design of the project, as derived from the theory of change outlined in the logframe matrix, is strategically structured to address the core issues affecting marginalized groups in Hebron. Here's a detailed analysis of the project design based on the information provided:

Strategic Focus and Alignment

1. Targeting Systemic Change:

- The project targets systemic change by involving marginalized groups, particularly women and youth, in local governance and development processes. This is aimed at transforming public services into more equitable, participatory, and responsive systems.

2. Multi-level Engagement:

- The project design incorporates multi-level engagement strategies, encompassing direct engagement with CBOs & CSOs, policy dialogue with Hebron Municipality, and community mobilization efforts as well as universities including Hebron University, Al-Quds Open University and Bethlehem University. Initially, the project targeted and included 20 CBOs/CSOs, but due to various reasons, the number eventually settled at 17 CBOs/CSOs over the course of the project. This comprehensive approach ensures that change is driven from both the grassroots level and the top, facilitating a broader systemic impact by addressing issues at multiple levels of society and governance.

Outputs and Activities

1. Capacity Building:

- Activities such as training and capacity building for CBOs, CSOs, and municipal staff are central to the project. These are designed to ensure that stakeholders have the necessary skills and resources to advocate for and implement the desired changes.

2. Innovative Tools for Engagement:

- The introduction of ICT solutions to collect feedback on public services represents a forward-thinking approach to enhancing civic engagement and transparency. These tools are designed to make it easier for citizens to communicate their needs and for the municipality to respond effectively.

3. Policy Advocacy and Dialogue:

- Structured policy dialogues and advocacy efforts are planned to influence local policies and practices directly. These activities are critical for embedding the needs of marginalized groups into municipal decision-making processes.

Indicators and Measurement

1. Quantitative and Qualitative Indicators:

- The project uses a mix of quantitative and qualitative indicators to measure success. These include the number of policy suggestions made by targeted groups, the percentage increase in service satisfaction, and documented changes in CBOs' service delivery.

2. Regular Monitoring:

- Bi-annual accountability sessions and ongoing assessments ensure that the project remains on track and adjustments are made as necessary. This regular monitoring is crucial for evaluating the effectiveness of the interventions and the project's impact over time.

Assumptions and Risks

1. Administrative Stability:

- The project assumes that the municipal administrative framework remains stable and supportive of the participatory approaches introduced by the project. Any significant changes in this area could impact the project's success.

2. Long-term Engagement:

3. PROJECT STRATEGY

- Another critical assumption is the continued engagement of all stakeholders, including CBOs, CSOs, and municipal authorities, beyond the project's timeframe. This sustained engagement is essential for the long-term impact and sustainability of the project outcomes.

Sustainability and Exit Strategy

- The project design includes a clearly defined exit strategy focusing on empowering local entities to continue the work initiated by the project. This approach is vital for ensuring that the improvements made during the project have a lasting impact.

Overall, the project is well-designed to achieve its objectives, with a strong emphasis on empowerment, capacity building, and systemic change. Its success, however, will largely depend on the accurate execution of its activities, the stability of local governance structures, and the ongoing commitment of all project stakeholders.

However, there are some potential weaknesses that could affect its effectiveness and sustainability:

1. Dependency on External Stability:

- A significant weakness is the project's dependency on the stability of the municipal administrative framework and the unstable political circumstances surrounding the area. Changes in local government policies or personnel could disrupt the progress and sustainability of the interventions. This reliance makes the project vulnerable to external political and administrative changes that are outside the control of the project implementers. The volatile political environment in the region, coupled with the tradition sensitivity, adds an additional layer of complexity and uncertainty, potentially hindering the project's ability to achieve its objectives and maintain long-term impact. Navigating the delicate balance between respecting traditional values and implementing necessary changes requires careful consideration and adaptation to ensure the project's success.

2. Assumptions about Continued Engagement:

- The theory assumes sustained engagement from all stakeholders, including CBOs, CSOs, municipal authorities, and the community. If the interest or participation levels drop post-project, the long-term impact could be significantly reduced. Maintaining engagement without the ongoing support of the project could be challenging, especially in volatile or resource-constrained environments.

3. Complexity and Scalability:

- The multi-faceted approach, while comprehensive, adds complexity to the project implementation. Managing multiple stakeholders and processes simultaneously can lead to challenges in coordination and execution. Additionally, the scalability of the project might be limited by resource availability and the specific local context of Hebron, which may not be easily replicable in other settings without substantial adjustments.

4. Measurement of Long-term Outcomes:

- While the project sets clear short-term indicators, the long-term societal changes it aims to achieve might be harder to measure. The impact on creating a more equal, open, and democratic society could take years to materialize and may be influenced by factors beyond the project's scope. This could make it difficult to accurately assess the project's success in achieving its overall objective.

5. Risk Mitigation Strategies:

- The theory of change could be strengthened by incorporating more robust risk mitigation strategies to handle potential administrative changes or drops in stakeholder engagement. Without these strategies, the project risks losing momentum and failing to achieve its intended impact.

4. Evaluation Findings

4.1 RELEVANCE

The project "Women and Youth Transforming local public services in Hebron" aimed to enhance the capacity of Palestinian civil society to contribute to development and governance processes in Hebron by addressing the needs of Community-Based Organizations (CBOs) in marginalized areas. The project's objectives were highly relevant to the target groups' needs, as identified through participatory assessments conducted by women's organizations on service delivery within their communities.

Alignment with local, National and International Strategies

The desk review establishes the pressing needs and priorities of women and youth in Hebron. Women face deep-seated barriers to equal political, economic, and social participation, and remain underrepresented in decision-making roles. Conservative social norms, limited mobility, and a lack of gender-sensitive facilities and services constrain women's access to public spaces and opportunities. Youth in Hebron also face significant challenges, including high unemployment, limited economic prospects, and a lack of youth-friendly spaces and services, contributing to feelings of frustration and exclusion.

In this context, the project's objectives of promoting more responsive and inclusive municipal services, with specific attention to the needs of women and youth, appear highly relevant. The theory of change – that increasing the capacity and engagement of local stakeholders in service delivery and decision-making will result in more equitable outcomes – aligns with global evidence on the importance of inclusive governance for sustainable development.

The project's focus on strengthening participatory municipal governance and service delivery aligns with Hebron's local development priorities. The municipality's strategic plan emphasizes inclusive, accountable, and efficient service provision as key goals, which the project directly supported by building stakeholder capacity, improving systems and policies, and piloting community-driven solutions.

The project's objectives are relevant to the Palestinian National Policy Agenda 2017-2022, which emphasizes the importance of strengthening civil society and promoting good governance and transparency. By enhancing the capacity of CBOs and fostering their engagement in local development processes, the project contributes to the realization of these national priorities.

Furthermore, the project aligns with several Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), particularly SDG 5 (Gender Equality), SDG 10 (Reduced Inequalities), SDG 11 (Sustainable Cities and Communities), and SDG 16 (Peace, Justice, and Strong Institutions). The focus on empowering women and youth, promoting inclusive governance, and improving municipal services.

4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

Relevance of Project Design

The project's planned activities aimed to tackle some of the barriers faced by women and youth in accessing municipal services in Hebron. Outreach and awareness-raising sessions aimed to increase their knowledge of rights and available services, while training municipal staff and CBOs on gender and disability inclusion intended to promote more sensitive and equitable service delivery. Improving the complaints system to better capture and resolve issues faced by women and people with disabilities (PWDs) could have reduced barriers to seeking redress.

Perceptions of Target Groups and Stakeholders

The organizational survey provides some positive indications of the project's relevance, with most respondents agreeing that it made CBO/CSO services more responsive to their needs and interests. However, the small sample size and lack of disaggregated demographic data limit the conclusiveness of these findings.

Interviews with municipal officials offer mixed perceptions. While some found the project relevant in areas like capacity building, system improvements, and community engagement, others felt it fell short in addressing youth needs and supporting local initiatives as promised. The assessment of relevance to target groups is limited due to insufficient direct feedback from women and youth beneficiaries, as well as partner CBOs/CSOs. This limitation stems from a low response rate to the surveys conducted.

Relevance of Project Activities and Outputs

The project planned a range of activities aimed at building capacity, improving systems, changing policies, and supporting community initiatives. Interviews suggest some of these activities did produce relevant outputs, while others faced challenges:

- The parking app developed through the youth competition was adopted by the municipality and seen as a useful tool to improve parking services, showing the potential of engaging youth in developing innovative solutions. However, the full parking sensor system could not be deployed due to the fact that the telecom sector is regulated and controlled by Israeli policies and regulations, which prevented the procurement of necessary hardware components, diminishing the overall impact. Despite this setback, an agreement was made between the ICT developing company and the IT department in the Municipality; once the devices enter the region, they will be completing the fieldwork of the hardware component. This arrangement demonstrates the project's adaptability and commitment to overcoming obstacles posed by the complex political and regulatory environment.
- Training for municipality staff on topics like citizen service and IT was seen as relevant for improving performance.
- Modifications to the municipal complaints system to flag and prioritize issues raised by women and PWDs were a relevant step to make the system more responsive to their needs. Data should be collected to assess whether this results in more complaints from these groups being satisfactorily resolved.
- The development of policies aimed at enhancing municipal transparency, accountability, and inclusiveness is highly relevant. While these policies have been approved by the municipal council, the extent of their implementation and enforcement remains unclear. Translating these policies into practice will require sustained effort. Alianza is committed to following up on this process until the end of November 2024 to ensure effective implementation.

Support to community initiatives, especially those led by or benefiting women and youth, was meant to be a key component. However, interviews indicate this aspect fell short of expectations, with no funding and support actually reaching CSOs/CBOs. Greater involvement of community partners in design and more sustained engagement could have made this component more impactful.

4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

The organizational survey results are generally positive about the project's relevance, with respondents agreeing it improved the responsiveness of CBO/CSO services.

Relevance in Light of External Factors

The project's relevance faced significant challenges due to the deteriorating security situation in Hebron, particularly in the old city and H2 area. The heightened risks and ongoing violence severely hindered the implementation of some activities, especially those related to the grant scheme for CBOs (Output 4). Capacity-building initiatives, advocacy campaigns, and other CBO-related activities were disrupted, reducing their potential relevance and impact. However, the project team demonstrated adaptability by conducting a comprehensive assessment and proposing alternative activities to benefit the target groups amidst the critical situation, helping to maintain the project's relevance in the face of external constraints.

Despite these challenges, project team obtained permission from EU to implement several activities in the project's final quarter. These included developing and adopting a Citizen's Online Participation Policy by reviewing, finalizing, and disseminating the policy in collaboration with stakeholders, harmonizing 16 existing policies for Hebron Municipality, and producing a Handbook of Standard Operating Policy for Citizen Participation. They also aimed to complete the software component of the ICT solution, provide the source code to the municipality, and build the capacity of municipal staff on using and updating the new system. Lastly, they planned to conduct a media and communication campaign on TV, radio, and social media, highlighting women as agents of positive change at all societal levels, and submit a final social media report. These activities helped to maintain the project's relevance and adapt to the challenging external factors.

Conclusion

Based on the data collected and provided, it seems that the project's overall objectives and approach as designed were highly relevant to the needs and priorities of the target groups and local context in Hebron, as well as to national and international development strategies. The focus on improving the inclusiveness and responsiveness of municipal services, by building stakeholder capacity and voice, was well-justified and aligned with development principles.

Despite best efforts, the project faced unforeseen obstacles that impacted its overall success. Coordinating activities among various partners and stakeholders proved challenging, and a volatile security situation further complicated implementation efforts. As a result, not all planned activities were fully realized, ultimately impacting the relevance and impact of some project outputs. A more participatory design process to validate the theory of change and incorporate stakeholder feedback, along with more adaptive management to adjust course as needed, could have strengthened relevance. The project experience highlights the importance of flexibility and the need to balance ambitious objectives with realistic planning in a complex and shifting environment.

Despite these challenges, the project did achieve some relevant results and lay groundwork for continued efforts. Lessons learned should be captured and shared to inform the design of future projects. With refinement and sustained commitment, this model of supporting good municipal governance has strong potential to advance development goals in Palestine, even in the face of significant contextual obstacles.

Overall, despite some shortcomings, the project demonstrated the relevance of inclusive municipal governance as a driver of local development in Hebron. Future efforts should build on the lessons learned to more fully address the structural barriers facing women and youth and promote enduring institutional and social change. Embedding stakeholder participation and learning throughout project cycles can strengthen the ongoing relevance of development interventions in complex contexts.

4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

4.2 EFFECTIVENESS

The project "Women and Youth Transforming local public services in Hebron" demonstrated mixed effectiveness in achieving its intended outcomes and objectives. The project aimed to improve the responsiveness and inclusiveness of municipal services in Hebron, particularly for women and youth, through capacity building, system improvements, policy changes, and community engagement.

Degree of Achievement of Intended Outcomes and Objectives

The project partially achieved its intended outcomes and objectives. Output 1, which focused on building the capacity of youth- and women-led CBOs to become advocates and engage in policy dialogue with the Hebron Municipality, was partially realized.

From April to September 2023, efforts were made to plan activity R1.a6: "Promote decision-making spaces where users of public services can assess them and articulate their feedback to the municipality." This activity was scheduled for the last semester. Meetings with the Hebron Municipality and CBOs were held to discuss the new implementation period and review the work plan.

Two dialogue spaces were planned, expecting to involve 180 participants, including public service users and municipal service providers. The first session was to target local society (17 CBOs with their employees and volunteers) and 10 service providers, aiming to discuss various services and gather feedback. Service providers would then formulate a position paper incorporating citizens' main demands. The second session would involve Municipal Service Providers, Municipal Council Representatives, Municipality Partners, NGOs, and Donors to address needs identified in the first session.

However, exceptional circumstances disrupted these plans, making participant mobilization extremely challenging. After multiple postponements, a new strategy was adopted to achieve objectives through a more feasible methodology. A survey was distributed to participating CBOs to gather opinions on municipal services. The results were systematized and officially communicated to the Municipality. Despite the challenging timing, 11 CBOs participated in the survey.

It's worth noting that while formal policy dialogues couldn't be conducted, the campaign plans developed by CBOs, especially women-led organizations, included at least one activity involving the Municipality, such as dialogues, round tables, or accountability sessions.

Output 2 aimed to establish participatory, innovative, and accessible service delivery mechanisms within Hebron Municipality. Significant progress was made in designing and promoting innovative ICT tools, particularly a dedicated app. However, full implementation was hindered by external factors. Regulations imposed on the telecom sector by Israeli policies prevented the procurement of essential hardware components. This unforeseen obstacle limited the initiative's overall impact.

Output 3, which sought to strengthen the capacities within Hebron Municipality to manage and promote citizen participation and respond to feedback, was achieved to a certain extent. However, it is too early to assess the outcomes of these activities or the extent to which they contributed to strengthening the Municipality's capacity.

Output 4, aimed at establishing a grant scheme for targeted Community-Based Organizations (CBOs) and civil society organizations, faced significant challenges due to Hebron's increasingly volatile security situation. The escalation of political tensions and frequent violent clashes, especially in sensitive areas like the old city (H2 and C areas), created a climate of fear and uncertainty.

Despite these obstacles, substantial progress was made in line with Output 4:

1. Communication enhancement: At least 12 CBOs improved their communication and visibility materials.

4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

2. Community engagement: Several organizations successfully involved community members in project activities and training (e.g., R1.A5, R1.A6).
3. Advocacy skills development: CBOs effectively learned to design advocacy campaigns, create campaign plans, and select relevant topics and messages. This skill proved valuable, as evidenced by at least two women-led CBOs and one cultural CBO implementing their plans using alternative funding sources.
4. Capacity assessment: A comprehensive needs assessment was conducted for all 20 CBOs, increasing their awareness of specific capacity-building requirements.

These achievements demonstrate significant progress in organizational development and capacity building, even in challenging circumstances. While the project couldn't provide specific support for implementing all planned activities, the skills and knowledge gained by the CBOs represent important assets for their future work.

Effectiveness in Enhancing CBO and CSO Capacity

The project demonstrated some success in enhancing the capacity of CBOs and CSOs to address the needs of women and youth in public service delivery. The capacity-building activities, such as information sessions on municipal e-services, training on gender-sensitive and participatory assessments, negotiation skills, women's rights, and women's political participation, contributed to strengthening the CBOs' ability to represent their constituencies in policy dialogue and local democratic processes.

However, the data collected or reported by the project does not provide the specific outcomes achieved in terms of improved public service delivery for women and youth.

4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

Factors Contributing to or Hindering Achievement of Outcomes

Several factors influenced the project's effectiveness. Positively, the project leveraged partnerships between the municipality, civil society, and the private sector to pool expertise and resources. The project's alignment with municipal strategic priorities, such as improving service quality and citizen engagement, likely facilitated buy-in and ownership.

The project encountered several challenges that significantly impacted its effectiveness. The deteriorating security situation in Hebron severely constrained the project's ability to engage with CBOs and CSOs and execute planned activities. Additionally, resource limitations and procurement bureaucracy hampered the timely achievement of some outputs. An interviewee highlighted design limitations, such as the project's short duration relative to its ambitious objectives, insufficient comprehensive needs assessment, and inadequate stakeholder consultation. Furthermore, lengthy processes with the EU to secure budgetary and extension approvals resulted in extended periods of uncertainty, adversely affecting planning and implementation. These challenges collectively contributed to implementation difficulties and reduced the project's overall effectiveness. The combination of external factors (security situation), internal constraints (resource limitations), and procedural issues (EU approval processes) created a complex environment that hindered the full realization of project goals.

Stakeholder Satisfaction and Perceptions

Based on the survey conducted with Community-Based Organizations (CBOs) that participated in the project activities, the overall satisfaction and perceptions regarding the project's effectiveness are mixed.

Services Responsiveness and Participation:

While 33.33% of respondents agree that the services delivered by CBOs and Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) have become more responsive to their needs and interests during the project, a larger proportion (46.67%) maintain a neutral stance, suggesting that the project's impact on improving service responsiveness is not widely perceived by the CBOs.

Women's Rights Awareness:

A majority of respondents (53.85%) either agree or strongly agree that they have noticed increased awareness in their community regarding women's rights and women's political participation, indicating some success in raising awareness about these important issues among the CBOs.

Services and ICT Feedback:

A significant majority of respondents (61.54%) reported that they have not used the municipality's e-services or provided feedback through ICT solutions like mobile apps during the project. This finding highlights the limited adoption and usage of these digital platforms by the CBOs, which can be attributed to the fact that the app is still under development and not yet fully launched for public use.

Capacity Building:

A majority of respondents (61.53%) either agree or strongly agree that their capacity to engage in civic participation and community leadership has been strengthened through this project, suggesting the project's effectiveness in building the capacity of CBOs in these areas.

Community Support for Youth Involvement:

Respondents have mixed perceptions regarding the improvement of community support and perception of youth involvement in CBOs/CSOs during the project. While 38.46% agree, 30.77% maintain a neutral stance, and 30.77% disagree or strongly disagree, indicating varying levels of perceived improvement.

4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

Inclusivity and Engagement:

A majority of respondents (53.84%) either agree or strongly agree that the activities organized by CBOs and CSOs have become more inclusive and engaging for women and youth. However, a significant minority (23.08%) disagrees, suggesting room for further improvement in inclusivity and engagement.

Overall, the survey results indicate mixed satisfaction and perceptions regarding the project's effectiveness among the CBOs. While some areas show positive impacts, such as increased awareness of women's rights and capacity building, other areas, such as the adoption and usage of digital platforms by CBOs, indicate limited success.

Collaboration and Partnerships

The project made some efforts to foster collaboration and partnerships between CBOs/CSOs and local public institutions. The youth competition and parking app development exemplified the potential of collaboration between the municipality, civil society, and the private sector. Open meetings and dialogues between the Municipality and CBOs were also carried out as part of Output 3.

However, the data collected and reported by the project does not provide detailed information on the extent and outcomes of these collaborative efforts. The challenges faced in implementing Output 4, which involved a grant scheme for CBOs and CSOs, suggest that the project's ability to foster sustained partnerships was limited by the deteriorating security situation and other contextual factors.

Conclusion

The project demonstrated mixed effectiveness in achieving its intended outcomes. While progress was made in building the capacity of CBOs, promoting innovative ICT tools, and strengthening the Municipality's capacity to manage citizen participation, the challenging security situation in Hebron and the COVID-19 pandemic significantly hindered the implementation of some activities. Stakeholder satisfaction and perceptions regarding the project's effectiveness were mixed, with some areas showing positive impacts and others indicating limited success. The project made some efforts to foster collaboration and partnerships between CBOs/CSOs and local public institutions, but the extent and outcomes of these efforts are not fully clear from the available information. Lessons from this project, both successes and failures, should inform the design and implementation of future efforts to advance the project's objectives through subsequent programming.

4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

4.3 EFFICIENCY

The efficiency of the project "Empowering Women and Youth to Transform Local Public Services in Hebron" can be evaluated by examining how well resources were utilized to achieve intended outcomes, the justification of invested resources, risk management and adaptability, potential for achieving similar results with fewer resources, and the effectiveness of monitoring and evaluation processes.

Utilization of Project Resources:

An analysis of the project's resource utilization reveals a mixed picture of efficiency. The project leveraged partnerships and local capacities to deliver some cost-effective solutions. For instance, the youth competition resulting in the development of a successful parking app demonstrated efficient use of municipal support, community expertise, and volunteer engagement to create a relevant and innovative output with ongoing adoption and scaling potential. Similarly, the project's focus on building the capacity of local CBOs/CSOs and municipal staff could be viewed as an efficient investment in strengthening sustainable service delivery and community engagement beyond the project's lifespan.

Stakeholder feedback reveals potential issues with resource allocation and efficiency. The head of the Municipality's Community Activities Department criticized the project for inadequately supporting youth and cultural centers, despite initial commitments. Alianza responded by asserting they acted in accordance with the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) signed with the Municipality. This discrepancy might be influenced by the failure to provide sub-grants to Civil Society Organizations (CSOs). If accurate, this suggests a breakdown in communication with the Municipality. Furthermore, procurement delays have prevented the full installation of the parking sensor system, raising concerns about suboptimal use of funds and time on a potentially underutilized component.

Various implementation challenges compromised the project's efficient use of resources. Coordination gaps between partners, staff turnover, and communication breakdowns with stakeholders hindered smooth operations. Contextual disruptions, including the pandemic and conflict escalation, further complicated matters. These issues likely led to suboptimal resource deployment and required costly adaptations and realignments.

Alianza noted that the challenging environment exacerbated efficiency concerns, particularly regarding funds transferred to Community-Based Organizations (CBOs). The context made it difficult to ensure these funds were used efficiently and properly justified for project purposes within the available timeframe. This added complexity to the project's resource management and accountability efforts, further straining overall efficiency.

4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

Justification of Invested Resources:

The parking app's successful development and adoption, with the potential for sustained benefits in user satisfaction, revenue generation, and traffic management, could justify the resources invested in this component if these gains are realized and scaled. Likewise, if the capacity building efforts with CBOs/CSOs and municipal departments yield tangible, lasting improvements in service delivery and community engagement, these could be considered worthwhile investments. However, the mixed feedback in the organizational survey regarding the quality and relevance of training materials and facilitators suggests a need for further verification of capacity outcomes against resource inputs.

Conversely, the incomplete parking sensor installation (at the time of the interview) and the perceived neglect of youth and cultural centers imply a potential misalignment between invested resources and delivered value from the perspective of some stakeholders. A more granular examination of resource allocation against output achievement and stakeholder priorities would be necessary to comprehensively assess the justification of project investments.

Risk Management and Adaptability:

The project encountered substantial risks and challenges that required effective management and adaptation to maintain efficiency. The primary contextual risk was the deteriorating security situation in Hebron, particularly in the old city and H2 area. This severely impeded engagement with local Community-Based Organizations (CBOs) and Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), as well as the execution of planned activities.

The COVID-19 pandemic further exacerbated implementation difficulties, contributing to the need for a second project extension. Additionally, lengthy processes with the European Union (EU) to secure budgetary and extension approvals posed additional challenges.

These combined factors created a complex operating environment, necessitating continuous adaptation and resilience from the project team to maintain progress towards objectives while managing resource efficiency.

While the project team demonstrated some adaptive capacity, such as conducting a comprehensive assessment with CBOs and the municipality to explore alternative arrangements, the available evidence suggests limitations in risk anticipation and mitigation planning. Feedback from staff and partners highlights issues like coordination gaps, staffing turnover, and communication breakdowns that undermined efficient adjustment to changing circumstances. More proactive risk management and contingency planning, particularly around partnerships and stakeholder engagement, may have enhanced the project's agility and efficiency in navigating foreseeable hurdles.

The project's monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system, based on a Logical Framework Matrix, did not appear to provide a robust foundation for efficiency tracking and informed decision-making to swiftly address risks and challenges. The lack of detailed M&E data in the available reporting obscures a systematic analysis of how well the project adapted its resource utilization to stay on track amidst disruptions. More explicit integration of efficiency considerations and risk indicators into the project's M&E framework, along with clear methods for continuous learning and course correction, may have helped optimize resource use in a fluid context.

Potential for Achieving Similar Results with Fewer Resources:

Assessing if the project could have achieved similar results with fewer resources or in a shorter timeframe would require a comparative analysis of resource inputs against quality and timeliness of outputs, relative to industry benchmarks or alternative project models. The available evidence does not contain sufficient data for such a comprehensive efficiency benchmarking exercise.

4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

However, some areas of potential resource optimization can be inferred from the project's performance. The coordination and communication challenges between project partners suggest possible duplication of efforts and implementation delays that may have been avoidable with clearer roles, responsibilities, and information-sharing protocols from the outset. Likewise, more strategic partnering and capacity assessments might have averted the misalignment of expectations and commitments with stakeholders like the youth and cultural centers.

It is important to recognize, however, the inherent challenges of efficiency optimization in a complex, multi-stakeholder project operating in a volatile context. Adaptations and realignments necessitated by conflict escalation and pandemic disruptions likely required additional resources that would have been difficult to anticipate or avoid. The project's ability to deliver its intended results within its available resources and shifting timeframes was constrained by external factors largely beyond its control.

Conclusion:

The efficiency of the "Empowering Women and Youth to Transform Local Public Services in Hebron" project yields a mixed assessment based on the available evidence. While the project achieved some cost-effective resource utilization through strategic partnering and capacity building, it also faced efficiency challenges due to coordination gaps, risk management limitations, and contextual disruptions.

The project's successful outputs, such as the parking app and potential for sustainable stakeholder capacity gains, suggest a degree of justification for the invested resources. However, instances of resource misallocation, unmet stakeholder expectations, and underutilized components point to areas where efficiency could have been improved.

The project's M&E system did not appear to provide a strong basis for efficiency tracking, learning, and adaptation, with limited granular data and analysis on resource optimization. A more robust M&E framework, with clear efficiency metrics, regular reviews, and sufficient resourcing, could have better informed strategic decision-making and accountability.

While the project demonstrated some adaptability in the face of significant external challenges, a more proactive approach to risk management, contingency planning, and phased implementation might have mitigated resource inefficiencies and delivery delays.

Overall, the project's efficiency reflects a complex interplay of strategic resource deployment, contextual constraints, adaptive management, and M&E effectiveness. While the project achieved notable successes in a challenging environment, there are evident areas for efficiency optimization that could inform future programming.

4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

4.4 IMPACT

The "Women and Youth Transforming Local Public Services in Hebron" project aimed to bring about sustainable changes in improving access to quality public services for women and youth in Hebron and empowering their participation in decision-making processes. While the project achieved some progress towards these objectives, the full extent and sustainability of its impact are not clearly evidenced in the provided documents, particularly given the significant challenges encountered during implementation.

Sustainable Changes in Access to Quality Public Services

The project made efforts to improve access to quality public services for women and youth in Hebron through various interventions. These included designing and promoting innovative ICT tools to increase public accessibility to services and improve feedback mechanisms, strengthening capacities within Hebron Municipality to manage and promote citizen participation, and implementing awareness campaigns by Community-Based Organizations (CBOs) to transform municipality services.

However, the long-term sustainability of these changes is uncertain. The deteriorating security situation in Hebron, particularly during the crucial final stages of the project, presented significant obstacles. The escalation of conflict, including the war in Gaza and its repercussions in the West Bank, forced the suspension of key project activities. As a result, participating centers were unable to receive promised equipment and financial support, ultimately hindering the project's ability to fully achieve its intended outcomes. These disruptions likely limited the project's impact on establishing lasting improvements in public service access for women and youth.

Empowerment of Women and Youth in Decision-Making

The project's goal was to enhance women's and youth's participation in public service decision-making processes through capacity-building and advocacy initiatives. Feedback from project staff interviews and post-training surveys suggests that the provided training and support effectively improved participants' knowledge, skills, and confidence in local governance engagement.

Survey results revealed that 85% of participants gained new information and skills related to gender equality and women's rights. Additionally, 80% expressed confidence in applying the learned concepts to their professional or personal lives.

Most surveyed participants reported feeling that their interests were better represented and that they had gained more influence in local decision-making processes following the project's completion.

However, translating this individual empowerment into sustained and meaningful participation in decision-making processes faced challenges. Entrenched socio-cultural barriers and patriarchal attitudes still limit women's full and equal participation. The project also encountered difficulties in engaging with the Hebron Municipality, who were at times perceived as bureaucratic and inflexible in responding to community demands (Interview with one project staff). More systemic changes and sustained advocacy efforts may be needed to fully realize women and youth's potential in influencing local development processes.

4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

Unintended Impacts

The available evidence offers limited direct insights into the project's unintended positive or negative impacts on the target groups and the wider community. One potential unintended positive impact could be the strengthening of social capital and networks among participating community-based organizations (CBOs), as the project fostered collaboration and relationships between different organizations (Interview with one project staff). However, the escalation of conflict, including the war in Gaza and its repercussions in the West Bank, led to disruptions and the inability to deliver promised support to CBOs. This situation could have had unintended negative effects on the participating organizations and their constituencies, potentially undermining trust and confidence in the project's ability to deliver on its commitments during times of heightened instability and uncertainty.

Influence on Policies, Practices, and Attitudes

The project had some influence on attitudes towards women and youth participation in local development, particularly among the participating CBOs and Hebron Municipality. The capacity-building and advocacy efforts contributed to a shift in mindsets, with some council members showing increased receptivity to women's engagement. The project also prompted the municipality to review its internal policies and practices related to gender-responsive governance (Head of IT Department Interview).

However, concrete changes in policies, practices, or decision-making processes to institutionalize women and youth's participation are not yet apparent. Sustained engagement and advocacy beyond the project timeframe may be required to translate the initial attitudinal shifts into tangible institutional reforms.

Stakeholder Satisfaction and Perceptions

The overall satisfaction and perceptions of the project's impact among participating CBOs are mixed, based on the survey results. While some positive outcomes were noted, significant proportions of respondents expressed dissatisfaction in several areas:

- 73.33% of respondents either strongly disagreed or disagreed that the Municipality of Hebron has become more responsive to their needs and feedback as a result of the project.
- 61.54% of respondents either disagreed or strongly disagreed that they have participated in accountability sessions with the municipality's services and felt their voice was heard.
- 69.23% of respondents either disagreed or strongly disagreed that the municipality's cultural, sports, and youth centers have become more youth-friendly and responsive to their needs.
- 53.84% of respondents either disagreed or strongly disagreed that the project has contributed to a more equal, open, and democratic society in Palestine.

These survey results highlight the need for more comprehensive and sustained efforts to address stakeholder concerns and achieve broader societal impact.

4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

Gaps and Limitations in Assessing Impact

The available documents provide valuable insights into the project's impact, but some gaps and limitations in the evidence base should be acknowledged:

1. **Limited quantitative data:** The reports and interviews primarily offer qualitative perspectives on the project's impact, with limited quantitative data to support the findings. More specific metrics on the project's reach, changes in women and youth's representation in local governance, and the extent of improvement in public services would help quantify the impact.
2. **Perspectives of wider community:** The available evidence primarily captures the views of direct project participants and stakeholders, such as CBOs, CSOs, and Hebron Municipality. Incorporating the perspectives of the wider community, including ordinary citizens and different demographic groups, would offer a more comprehensive understanding of the project's impact on the ground.
3. **Unintended consequences:** While some potential unintended impacts are inferred from the evidence, a more systematic exploration of unintended consequences, both positive and negative, would provide a fuller impact assessment.
4. **Contribution versus attribution:** Given the complex and evolving context in which the project operated, it may be challenging to attribute certain changes solely to the project's interventions. A more nuanced analysis of the project's contribution to the observed outcomes, considering other influencing factors, would strengthen the impact assessment.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the "Women and Youth Transforming Local Public Services in Hebron" project made commendable efforts to improve access to quality public services and empower women and youth's participation in local decision-making processes. The project achieved some positive impact, such as enhancing individual capacities, raising awareness among Hebron Municipality, and initiating a shift in attitudes towards women and youth's participation.

However, the project faced significant challenges, including the deteriorating security situation and the COVID-19 pandemic, which disrupted activities and likely limited its potential impact. Translating the initial empowerment and attitudinal changes into sustainable improvements in public service access and institutionalized participation of women and youth in local governance remains an ongoing challenge.

To further strengthen the project's impact, a more comprehensive approach to gender equality, active engagement of the wider community, and sustained advocacy for policy and practice reforms would be beneficial. Continued efforts to address systemic barriers, ensure the sustainability and scalability of supported initiatives, and monitor long-term effects are crucial for realizing the project's full potential in transforming local public services and empowering women and youth in Hebron.

4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

4.5 SUSTAINABILITY

The "Women and Youth Transforming Local Public Services in Hebron" project in Palestine has demonstrated promising potential for sustainability, although several challenges remain. This analysis examines the project's sustainability based on the OECD evaluation criteria and the information provided in the attached documents.

Likelihood of Project Benefits Continuing Beyond Completion

The project has shown some encouraging signs that its benefits may continue after its conclusion. The capacity-building activities for women participants, such as training sessions and support for entrepreneurship initiatives, have empowered them with knowledge, skills, and increased confidence to engage in local governance. The participant survey results indicate that women feel more influential in decision-making processes, suggesting a potential for continued engagement.

However, the persistence of socio-cultural barriers and gender stereotypes, as highlighted in the desk review, poses a challenge to the long-term sustainability of these benefits. Sustaining the project's impact will require ongoing efforts to address these barriers and promote a supportive environment for women's participation.

Commitment of Stakeholders to Continuing, Expanding, or Replicating Project Processes and Knowledge

The commitment of stakeholders to sustaining and expanding the project's processes and knowledge is crucial for its long-term success. The interview with the head of IT from the Hebron Municipality suggests that the project has influenced the attitudes of the Hebron Municipality, prompting a review of policies and practices related to women's participation. This indicates a potential for continued support from local government.

According to the IT department chief, no observable changes in policies or decision-making procedures have been implemented yet. Enhancing collaboration with Hebron Municipality and promoting the integration of inclusive governance practices into their institutional structure will be vital for sustaining project results. Alianza indicated that they will monitor the progress of this institutionalization effort while executing the GOIB project in the coming months.

The provided documents do not explicitly address the commitment of participating women and civil society organizations (CSOs) to continuing the project's initiatives. However, there is evidence of some sustained impact: at least three Community-Based Organizations (CBOs) have implemented advocacy activities based on plans prepared within the project framework, using resources outside of the project. This suggests a degree of internalization and continuation of project objectives by some local organizations, even after the formal project activities concluded. While this is a positive indicator of potential sustainability, a more comprehensive assessment of participating stakeholders' long-term commitment would be needed to fully gauge the project's lasting effects.

Efforts Made by Project Partners to Enhance Sustainability

The project team's efforts to enhance sustainability are evident in their capacity-building activities for women participants and their engagement with the Hebron Municipality. These activities indirectly promote sustainability by empowering stakeholders and influencing institutional attitudes. However, more targeted sustainability measures, such as developing a comprehensive sustainability strategy, securing long-term funding commitments, and establishing formal partnerships with local stakeholders, were not explicitly mentioned. Incorporating such measures into project design and implementation could significantly enhance the likelihood of long-term sustainability.

4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

Towards the end of the project, collaboration with local Community-Based Organizations (CBOs), Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), target groups, and stakeholders resulted in the development of an agreed-upon exit strategy. The CBOs and CSOs formally committed to taking responsibility for the project's follow-up activities. Despite facing challenges and the cancellation of certain activities, the project team-maintained transparency and open communication, which were crucial in creating an exit plan to mitigate potential negative consequences. The CBOs appreciated the support received, acknowledging its value in empowering them to operate independently.

The project team adopted a collaborative approach when planning the exit strategy, which effectively fostered a sense of ownership and commitment among the local organizations involved. This inclusive process ensured that the CBOs and other stakeholders were actively engaged in shaping the project's future beyond its initial implementation phase.

To further enhance the project's sustainability, the team provided targeted capacity-building support to the CBOs. These efforts focused on equipping the local organizations with the necessary skills, knowledge, and confidence to continue their work independently. By investing in the development of the CBOs' capabilities, the project team aimed to create a lasting impact that would endure long after the project's conclusion.

The combination of the collaborative exit planning and the capacity-building initiatives demonstrated the project team's commitment to promoting long-term sustainability. By empowering the CBOs to take ownership of the project's outcomes and providing them with the tools to operate autonomously, the team sought to ensure that the project's benefits would continue to be realized and that the local organizations would be well-positioned to address future challenges in their communities.

Institutional, Financial, and Social Factors Affecting Sustainability

Several institutional, financial, and social factors may support or hinder the project's sustainability. The project's engagement with the Hebron Municipality and its influence on their attitudes towards women's participation is a positive institutional factor. However, translating this initial influence into concrete policy and practice changes will be crucial for institutional sustainability.

The financial sustainability of the project's outcomes is not thoroughly addressed in any of the project documents. Securing long-term funding commitments and structured networking from the Municipality, CSOs, and international donors could help sustain the project's initiatives.

Socially, the project has made progress in raising community awareness about gender equality in decision-making and empowering women participants. However, the persistence of socio-cultural barriers and gender stereotypes remains a significant challenge to social sustainability. Ongoing efforts to challenge these norms and engage the wider community will be essential.

In addition, Alianza's GOIB follow-up project, continuing until November, will facilitate further consolidation and follow-up activities. The potential implementation of future projects in Hebron could contribute to the sustainability of the organizations involved.

Scalability and replicability of the project's approach in other contexts could also contribute to its sustainability. Adapting the project's model to local contexts and ensuring stakeholder involvement in future interventions will be key for successful scaling and replication.

Conclusion

The " Women and Youth Transforming Local Public Services in Hebron " project has shown promising signs of sustainability in terms of its influence on individual capacities, attitudes of the Hebron Municipality, and community awareness. However, ensuring long-term sustainability will require continued efforts to translate these initial outcomes into lasting institutional, financial, and social changes.

4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

Strengthening partnerships with local stakeholders, securing long-term funding commitments, and addressing persistent socio-cultural barriers will be crucial for the project's sustainability. Incorporating targeted sustainability measures into project design and implementation, as well as ongoing monitoring and evaluation of sustainability indicators, could help ensure that the project's benefits continue to impact women's participation in local governance in the medium to long term.

5. Recommendations

Based on the results of the evaluation of the "Women and Youth Transforming Local Public Services in Hebron" project, the following strategic recommendations are proposed to enhance the project's relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, and sustainability:

1. **Capacity Building for Inclusive Advocacy**
Develop a comprehensive capacity-building program for CBOs and CSOs to enhance their skills in evidence-based advocacy, policy dialogue, and engagement with local authorities. Foster collaboration and knowledge-sharing among these organizations to amplify their collective voice in advocating for gender-sensitive and youth-friendly public services.
2. **Institutionalizing Participatory Governance**
Establish formal mechanisms for regular dialogue and consultation between the Hebron Municipality and CSOs, ensuring active CSO participation in local decision-making processes. Advocate for the adoption of policies and regulations that mandate CSO involvement in planning, budgeting, and monitoring of public services, and provide capacity-building support to the Municipality to effectively manage and promote citizen participation.
3. **Enhancing Transparency and Access to Information**
Support the Hebron Municipality in developing accessible and user-friendly information-sharing platforms to increase transparency and accountability. Conduct awareness-raising campaigns to educate citizens about their rights to access official information and participate in local governance processes, and advocate for the adoption of policies that promote proactive disclosure of public data.
4. **Continue promoting Inclusive and Responsive Public Services**
Assist the Hebron Municipality in conducting comprehensive needs assessments to identify service delivery gaps and priorities, particularly for women, youth, and marginalized groups. Encourage the adoption of innovative and participatory service delivery approaches, such as e-services and citizen feedback mechanisms, and advocate for the allocation of adequate resources to support the implementation of inclusive public services.
5. **Continue strengthening Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment**
Advocate for the adoption of gender-responsive budgeting practices in the Hebron Municipality and the establishment of a gender focal point to mainstream gender considerations in all local governance processes. Support CBOs and CSOs in implementing gender-sensitive advocacy campaigns and awareness-raising activities to challenge gender stereotypes and promote women's active participation in decision-making.
6. **Continue enhancing Community Engagement and Ownership**
Implement community outreach and mobilization strategies to raise awareness about the role of CBOs and CSOs in promoting inclusive local development. Organize regular community dialogues and town hall meetings to facilitate interaction between citizens, CBOs, CSOs, and local authorities, and encourage the development of participatory monitoring and evaluation mechanisms to assess the impact of interventions.
7. **Ensuring Sustainability and Scalability**
Develop a comprehensive sustainability strategy in collaboration with project partners, identifying key actions and resources needed to sustain project outcomes. Encourage the institutionalization of participatory governance mechanisms and inclusive public service delivery approaches through the adoption of relevant policies, regulations, and budgetary allocations, and explore opportunities for replicating and scaling up successful interventions in other municipalities and regions.
8. **Strengthening Monitoring, Evaluation, and Learning**

5. RECOMMENDATIONS

Develop a robust monitoring and evaluation framework with clear indicators and data collection methods to track progress towards project objectives. Encourage regular reflection and learning sessions among project partners to discuss challenges, success stories, and lessons learned, and invest in building the capacity of project staff and partners in monitoring, evaluation, and learning approaches to enhance data-driven decision-making and continuous improvement.

9. Continue fostering Multi-Stakeholder Partnerships

Cultivate strong partnerships with government agencies, donors, civil society networks, and other relevant stakeholders to leverage resources, expertise, and influence in advancing inclusive local governance and public service delivery. Engage in joint advocacy efforts, knowledge-sharing platforms, and collaborative initiatives to create an enabling environment for sustainable and transformative change.

6. Annexes

6.1 ANNEX 1 – TOOL FOR INTERVIEWS WITH PROJECT STAFF

Project Management:

1. What evidence have you seen that the project has helped strengthen the role of marginalized groups, especially women, as actors for change in local development processes in Palestine? Can you provide specific examples?
2. How has the project contributed to making public services in Hebron more accessible and responsive to the needs and interests of women and youth? What indicators or feedback support this?

Specific Objective 1:

3. In what ways have women-led CBOs and CSOs increased their advocacy and engagement in policy dialogue with the Hebron municipality to make services more gender-sensitive and youth-friendly?
4. What accountability mechanisms have been established between CBOs/CSOs and the municipality? How effective have these been in driving positive change?
5. To what extent has awareness increased among CBO/CSO members on women's rights and women's political participation? How was this measured?

Specific Objective 2:

6. What innovative and accessible service delivery mechanisms have been implemented by the Hebron municipality? How were these designed to meet citizen needs, especially those of women?
7. Has the municipality's ability to integrate citizen feedback into service improvements changed over the course of the project? What evidence supports this?
8. How effective have the information and awareness campaigns been in engaging the broader public? What was the reach and impact?

Specific Objective 3:

9. How have the municipality's internal capacities to manage and promote citizen participation evolved during the project? What systems, policies or practices have changed?
10. In what ways have communication channels improved between the municipality, service providers and centers? How has this impacted the integration of citizen feedback?
11. What attitudinal and behavioral changes have you observed among municipal staff in terms of supporting gender equality, women's rights and inclusiveness?

Specific Objective 4:

12. How have perceptions and support from the broader community changed in regards to the work of CBOs and CSOs on women and youth issues? What factors contributed to this?
13. To what degree has participation increased, especially among women and youth, in activities organized by CBOs and CSOs? What drew people to engage?
14. Which recommendations put forth by women's organizations were taken up and implemented in communities? What was the impact of this?
15. How have the advocacy capacities of CBOs/CSOs strengthened over the course of the project, especially in terms of human resources and internal organization? What difference has this made?

Project staff

1. How effectively has the project team collaborated with the Hebron Municipality, CSOs, and CBOs to achieve the project's objectives? What challenges were faced and how were they overcome?
2. To what extent has the project adapted to changes in the local context or unforeseen circumstances? Can you provide examples of how the project remained flexible and responsive?
3. How have you monitored and documented the project's progress against the logframe indicators? What systems are in place for data collection, analysis, and reporting?
4. In your opinion, which project activities or strategies have been most successful in promoting women's participation and gender-responsive local governance? Why?
10. How have you designed and implemented the project's M&E system to track progress against the logframe indicators? What tools and methods are being used?
14. Can you share any key findings or insights from the project's baseline and endline assessments, particularly related to women's participation and the capacity of local actors?
15. Based on your analysis of project data and feedback from stakeholders, what are the project's key achievements, challenges, and lessons learned to date?
16. How will the project's M&E findings be used to inform future programming or policy advocacy efforts related to gender-responsive local governance in Palestine?

Questions related to CSOs/CBOs:

5. How have you supported the capacity development of CSOs and CBOs in advocating for the needs and interests of women and youth? What training, mentoring, or other support was provided?
6. Can you describe the process of facilitating accountability sessions between CSOs/CBOs and the municipality? What was your role and what were the outcomes of these sessions?
7. How have you encouraged greater community support and involvement in the work of CSOs and CBOs, particularly in promoting women's rights and participation?
8. In what ways have the project's capacity development plans strengthened the organizational, financial, and human resource capacities of CSOs and CBOs? How was this progress measured?

Questions related to Hebron Municipality:

9. What technical assistance or guidance did you provide to the municipality in developing and implementing ICT solutions for citizen feedback and complaint handling?
11. How have you supported the municipality in designing and delivering information and awareness campaigns to promote citizen participation, especially among women and youth?
12. Can you describe your role in facilitating the adoption of an internal policy on citizen participation and online complaint handling within the municipality?
13. In what ways have you engaged municipal staff and decision makers to increase their awareness and commitment to gender equality, women's rights, and inclusive governance? What activities or approaches were most effective?

6.2 ANNEX 2 – TOOL FOR INTERVIEWS WITH MUNICIPAL STAFF

Overall Questions

1. In what ways has the municipality improved its capacity to manage and promote citizen participation, particularly among women and youth? What institutional changes have been made?
2. How has the municipality enhanced its responsiveness to citizen feedback received through various channels (e-gate, mobile app, service centers, CSO/CBO advocacy)? Can you share any specific examples?
3. To what extent have municipality staff, especially decision makers, increased their awareness and commitment to supporting gender equality, protecting women's rights, and ensuring their full inclusion in local governance? How was this achieved?
4. Moving forward, how will the municipality sustain and build upon the improvements made in participatory governance and gender-responsive service delivery beyond the project period?

For IT staff at the Municipality:

5. How has the municipality's e-services system been improved to encourage greater participation from female users? What specific features were added or enhanced?
6. Can you describe the innovative ICT solution(s) designed and implemented to collect citizen feedback on public services during the project period? How has this improved upon the previous system? – Nour – This is different to you mentioned in your comment. I'm asking the Municipality of how they collect feedback?
7. How do you evaluate the ICT solution (Parking +)?
8. By what percentage has the number of suggestions/feedback submitted through the mobile application and e-gate increased? How are these submissions handled and integrated into service improvements?

For complaint handling staff at the Municipality:

9. What changes have been made to the municipality's complaint mechanism to make it more comprehensive and accessible, especially for women and youth?
5. Has an internal policy on citizens' participation and online complaint handling been formally adopted by the municipality? What are the key components of this policy?
6. How would you rate the current effectiveness of communication channels between the municipality and its service providers/centers in addressing citizen feedback? What improvements have been made?

For social media staff (Public Relations Department):

7. Approximately how many people were reached by information and awareness campaigns through the municipality's social media channels and local media outlets? What were the key messages of these campaigns?
8. How has the municipality used social media to inform citizens about improvements in complaint handling and participatory decision-making processes? Can you provide some examples of successful posts or campaigns?

6.3 ANNEX 3 – TOOL FOR INTERVIEWS WITH CSOS & CBOS

Overall Objective:

1. How has your organization contributed to strengthening the role of marginalized groups, especially women and youth, as actors for change in local development processes? Can you provide specific examples?
2. In what ways has your work helped create a more equal, open and democratic society in Palestine?

Specific Objective:

3. How have your organization's services become more accessible and responsive to the needs and interests of women and youth in Hebron?
4. Can you describe your engagement with the Municipality of Hebron in evaluating their strategy and advocating for the needs of vulnerable groups?

Result 1:

5. How many suggestions has your organization submitted to the Municipality to make services more accessible and responsive to women and youth? What were some key suggestions?
6. How has your organization's participation in accountability sessions with the municipality changed over the project period?
6. To what extent has awareness increased among your staff and constituents regarding women's rights and political participation? How was this measured?
7. For municipality-led cultural, sports, or women's centers - have you integrated complaint/feedback mechanisms, participatory approaches, and good governance principles into your bylaws? Why or why not?

Result 4:

8. Has your organization experienced increased community support and involvement in your work? In what ways?
10. By what percentage has participation in your activities increased, especially among women and youth? To what factors do you attribute this change?
11. What recommendations suggested by women's organizations through campaigns have been implemented in the communities you serve? What was the impact?
12. In which specific capacity areas (human resources, financial, organizational) has your CBO been strengthened through this project's capacity development plans? How have you measured this improvement?

6. ANNEXES

6.4 ANNEX 4 – TOOL FOR FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION WITH WOMEN & YOUTH

For women beneficiaries:

1. How have the services delivered by CBOs and CSOs changed to better address your needs and interests over the course of this project? Can you provide specific examples?
2. To what extent do you feel the Municipality of Hebron is more responsive to your needs and feedback as a result of this project? What improvements have you noticed?
3. Have you participated in any accountability sessions with the municipality's services? If so, what was your experience and do you feel your voice was heard?
4. Have you noticed any changes in awareness among your community regarding women's rights and women's political participation? If yes, please describe.
5. Do you feel more empowered to advocate for your needs and engage in policy dialogue with local authorities as a result of this project? Why or why not?
6. Have you used the municipality's e-services or provided feedback through ICT solutions like mobile apps? If so, how was your experience?

For youth beneficiaries:

1. In what ways have the municipality's cultural, sports, and youth centers become more youth-friendly and responsive to your needs during this project? Please provide examples.
2. Have you participated in providing suggestions or feedback to the municipality through mobile apps or e-gates? If yes, what was the process and do you feel your input was valued?
3. To what extent have you noticed the municipality and CBOs/CSOs in your community becoming more open to youth participation and leadership? What changes have you observed?
4. Have you been involved in any advocacy campaigns or policy dialogues with local authorities organized by CBOs/CSOs? If so, please describe your experience and any outcomes.
5. Do you feel your capacity to engage in civic participation and community leadership has been strengthened through this project? In what ways?
6. How has community support and perception of youth involvement in CBOs/CSOs changed over the course of this project, from your perspective?

6.5 ANNEX 5 – PROJECT BENEFICIARY SURVEY

Please rate your level of agreement with the following statements on a scale of 1 to 5, where 1 = Strongly Disagree, 2 = Disagree, 3 = Neutral, 4 = Agree, and 5 = Strongly Agree.

1. The services delivered by CBOs and CSOs have become more responsive to my needs and interests during this project.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5
2. The Municipality of Hebron has become more responsive to my needs and feedback as a result of this project.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5
3. I have participated in accountability sessions with the municipality's services and felt my voice was heard.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5
4. I have noticed increased awareness in my community regarding women's rights and women's political participation.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5
5. I feel more empowered to advocate for my needs and engage in policy dialogue with local authorities due to this project.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5
6. I have used the municipality's e-services or provided feedback through ICT solutions like mobile apps during this project.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5
7. The municipality's cultural, sports, and youth centers have become more youth-friendly and responsive to my needs.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5
8. I have participated in providing suggestions or feedback to the municipality through mobile apps or e-gates.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5
 The municipality and CBOs/CSOs in my community have become more open to youth participation and leadership.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5
9. I have been involved in advocacy campaigns or policy dialogues with local authorities organized by CBOs/CSOs.
 1 2 3 4 5
10. My capacity to engage in civic participation and community leadership has been strengthened through this project.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5
11. Community support and perception of youth involvement in CBOs/CSOs have improved during this project.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5
12. The activities organized by CBOs and CSOs have become more inclusive and engaging for women and youth.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5
13. Recommendations suggested by women's organizations in local campaigns have been implemented in my community.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5
14. Overall, this project has contributed to a more equal, open, and democratic society in Palestine.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5
16. The training provided by this project has enhanced my knowledge and skills in advocating for women's rights and participation.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5

6. ANNEXES

17. The training sessions have prepared me to effectively engage in policy dialogue with local authorities and service providers.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5
18. The training has improved my understanding of the importance of accountability and good governance principles.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5
19. The training has provided me with the necessary tools and techniques to mobilize and lead community initiatives.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5
20. The quality and relevance of the training materials and facilitators met my expectations and learning needs.
 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5

6.6 ANNEX 6 – TOOL FOR CSOS ASSESSMENT ON WOMEN’S RIGHTS AND WOMEN POLITICAL PARTICIPATION

The same survey that was used in the baseline study.

Survey Questionnaire

Objective: To assess the level of awareness of CBOs and CSOs participating on women’s rights and women political participation.

Demographics

1. **Gender of participant:**
 - Male
 - Female
2. **Age:**
 - 18 - 24
 - 25 - 30
 - 31 – 38
3. **Level of Education:**
 - Primary
 - Secondary – High school
 - Graduate
 - Post graduate
 - Illiterate
4. **Marital Status:**
 - Married
 - Divorced
 - Widowed
 - Single
5. **Place of residence:**
 - City | Town
 - Village
 - Refugee Camp
 - Bedouin community
6. **Relationship to labor force:**
 - Business owner / Self Employed
 - Governmental Employee
 - Private Sector Employee
 - National Non-Governmental Institutions
 - International Non-Governmental Organization Employee
 - Unpaid domestic care work (taking care of children, family, etc.)
 - Unpaid work on family farm or business
 - Self-employed (on his/her own project/business)
 - Student
 - Unemployed / temporarily unemployed
 - Unable to work due to chronic illness or permanent disability
 - Retired
 - Other please specify:
7. **Have you ever participated in a training on women’s rights?**
 - Yes, once
 - Yes, a few times

6. ANNEXES

- Yes, many times
 - No, never.
- 8. 8. If Yes, did your participation impact your knowledge / increased your awareness and overall understanding on key issues related to women’s rights?**
- Positively (explain):
 - Negatively (explain):
 - Did not impact me in any way
- 9. Have you ever participated in a training on women’s political participation before?**
- Yes, once
 - Yes, a few times
 - Yes, many times
 - No, never.
- 10. If yes, did your participation impact your knowledge/ increased your awareness and overall understanding on key issues related to women’s rights to political participation?**
- Positively (explain):
 - Negatively (explain):
 - Did not impact me in any way

Section 1. Attitudes towards women’s roles and gender equality

- 1. Women and girls roles need to be restricted to private life (household)**
- Yes
 - No
 - I don’t know
- 2. Generally speaking, In Palestine women and men enjoy the same rights.**
- Yes
 - No
 - I don’t know
- 3. In Palestine, males and females experience the same challenges.**
- Yes
 - No
 - I don’t know
- 4. In your community, women’s involvement in social and political activities will impact their ability to care for their families (children and husband) and household chores.**
- Yes
 - No
 - I don’t know
- 5. 5. Gender equality will have a positive impact on the Palestinian Society**
- Yes
 - No
 - I don’t know

Section 2. Perception towards women's rights in the political sphere

- **What do you think of the following statement. Please state the extent to which you agree or disagree with the following statements**
- **Please rate as follows: 1. Strongly disagree / 2. Disagree/ 3. Neither agree or disagree (neutral) / 4. Agree / 5. Strongly Agree**

Statement	Extent of Agreeing
I believe that women's rights are human rights	
Gender equality should be extended to leadership and the political sphere In Palestine	
In Palestine, every woman should have the right to participate in the political life	
In Palestine, every woman should have the right to hold decision making positions	
Women are capable of holding high ranking positions involving decision/policy making and leadership	
I believe that every woman has the right to vote	
Every woman has the right to nominate herself for elections	
Women do not elect themselves for elections because people do not vote for women	
Women have the right to hold seats at the Palestinian Parliament	
I believe in the importance of women's quota in the political life	
Women should be consulted on their opinions and needs in the development processes	
In Palestine, there are legal rights in place to ensure women's access to political participation	
Elimination of all gender-based discrimination involves the elimination of all barriers hindering women's political participation	
I acknowledge that women are key actors in the local development process	
I believe that women's involvement and participation in CBOs will contribute towards greater social accountability	
CBOs have a critical role in promoting women's rights and participation in public services and political decision making	
It is important to involve women as key actors in strategic planning and accountability sessions	
Political parties in Palestine are key gatekeepers for women's political participation	
Women political leaders regret that they have engaged in political affairs and processes	

Section 3. Overall awareness and comprehension of the different contexts in Palestine relating to women's rights to political participation.

- 1.1 What are some of the gender inequalities that you could identify and perhaps have witnessed or experienced in the private sphere.
- 1.2 What are some of the gender inequalities that you could identify and perhaps have witnessed or experienced in the public sphere.
- 1.3 From your understanding, what are the different barriers, amongst others, in Palestine that hinder women's' participation in the political life and impacts the full realization of their rights. These could be related to social, legal, economic aspects, amongst others.

Section 4: Knowledge on the existence of laws relating to women's rights

Please indicate your personal level of knowledge and awareness on the existence of the following laws, declarations, treaties and Sustainable Development Goals on to the elimination of discrimination and the protection of women's political participation rights in Palestine and beyond.

Please rate the levels of knowledge as follows: 1. No Knowledge at all / 2. Low level / 2. intermediate/ 3. High level / 4. advance/ 4. No answer

- Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR)
- International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
- Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) that Palestine had ratified in 2014
- CEDAW's Optional Protocol that Palestine had signed in 2019
- United National Security Council Resolution **1325** on Women, Peace and Security
- United National Security Council Resolution **2250** on Youth, Peace and Security
- United Nation's Sustainable Development **Goal #5:** "Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls."
- United Nation's Sustainable Development **Goal #16:** "Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels
- Palestine Basic Law, **Article (26):** *All Palestinians shall have the right to participate in the political life individually and in groups.*
- Palestinian Election Law of 1995 N. 15, Under Chapter 2 – Section 1: **Article (6):** *The Right to Vote: Every elector shall exercise his or her right to vote in person, freely, directly, secretly and individually."*